

March 5, 2018

The Honourable Rob Fleming, Minister of Education
Scott MacDonald, Deputy Minister

via email

Dear Sirs,

We, as citizens, parents, educators and arts professionals are writing to express our collective concern regarding the marginalization of the arts (visual and performing) within K-12 public education and ask that the government commit to restore arts education within our public schools.

Executive Summary

The arts are relevant and vital to a public education system that seeks to allow all learners to “be literate, to develop their individual potential and to acquire the knowledge, skills, and attitudes needed to contribute to a healthy, democratic, and pluralistic society and a prosperous and sustainable economy.”ⁱ Education in the arts has a significant role to play in developing the social and emotional wellbeing of students and in equipping them with the creative, critical and empathic capacities needed to meet the social and economic challenges of a rapidly changing and interconnected world.

The absence of protected, targeted funding for the arts, coupled with the pressure to reduce operational expenditures at the school district level, has led to a steady and persistent erosion of quality and access to arts education over the last two decades. This erosion encompasses significant and critical losses in specialist expertise, material resources and dedicated space across K-12. In 2015/16, less than half of grade 4 and 7 students across the province indicated that they were learning about art or music.ⁱⁱ Dedicated spaces for art and music continue to be systematically eliminated as schools are rebuilt or seismically retrofitted to conform to the Ministry Area Standards that restrict the allowable square footage for new school facilities.

The public education system no longer provides a comprehensive, consistent or quality arts education. As a result, arts instruction is being outsourced through private lessons, charities or PAC fundraising, creating unacceptable inequity of access to the arts based on socio-economic advantage. A growing body of research underscores the pivotal role of art education for vulnerable student populations in academic success, mental health and social engagement. Participation in the cultural life of the community and the enjoyment of the arts is a fundamental human right; it is also integral to the implementation of the redesigned BC curriculum.

Urgent intervention is needed to restore equitable access to a quality arts education as a core element within the K-12 curriculum. We ask that the government:

- Amend the Ministry Area Standards to ensure that all new schools have sufficient dedicated space to provide quality arts education for future generations
- Allocate additional, targeted and protected funding to all school districts to enable them to provide the expertise and material resources needed to support a quality arts education for all students

Context and Background

Arts Education is Important

Education in the arts is essential for both the socio-emotional and the academic development of children. The United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), supported by a growing body of research, identifies the importance of quality arts education for renewing educational systems that seek to prepare students for the social, cultural and economic challenges of today's rapidly changing world.ⁱⁱⁱ

The core competencies in the redesigned BC curriculum (critical and creative thinking, communication, understanding of personal and cultural identities and social responsibility) all underscore the relevance of the arts, as these are the skills and habits of mind that the arts intrinsically teach.^{iv}

Education in the arts is needed to develop:

Innovation and Creativity:

Artistic practices intrinsically develop the divergent thinking, flexible purposing, persistence and critical reflection central to the creative process. Education in the arts is therefore key for developing the innovative capacities identified by educational and business leaders as the primary skill set for competitiveness in our 21st century economy^v. Canada falls well below the OECD average for percentage of time allocated to compulsory arts education.^{vi} While Canada performs high on current international PISA tests, the World Economic Forum shows its economic competitiveness to be compromised by relatively weak innovation capacity.^{vii}

Visual Literacy:

Digital media has transformed the means by which we share and transmit information. Today, over 85% of the information we absorb daily is visual.^{viii} Education in the arts has a role and a responsibility to equip students with the visual literacy and cultural understanding needed to critically engage and meaningfully contribute within our increasingly mediated public sphere.^{ix}

Mental Health and Societal Well-being:

Research in education and science link engagement in the arts to building the self-confidence, self-regulation and resilience needed for social and emotional well-being.^x Anxiety, depression and substance misuse are increasing amongst our youth and the arts are shown to promote mental wellbeing through hands on, material exploration and nurturing a healthy sense of identity through authentic self-expression. The latest research in neuroscience links arts to developing empathy and attending to the perspective of others.^{xi} This has broad implications for societal health and fostering intercultural understanding.^{xii}

Personal Fulfillment and Inclusion:

The arts are essential for cultivating imaginative thought, the senses and the capacity for play. These are key capabilities internationally recognized as indicators of the degree of human well-being, freedom and justice in a society.^{xiii} Further to this, participation in cultural production and enjoyment of the arts is not only identified by the United Nations as a fundamental human right^{xiv}, it is integral to Indigenous ways of knowing, learning and cultural empowerment.^{xv} A commitment to the educational goals of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission must include access to culturally appropriate education in the arts for all students.^{xvi}

Arts Education in BC Has Been Eroded

The lack of protected, targeted funding for the arts within the education funding envelope, coupled with the pressure to reduce operational expenditures at the school district level, has led to a steady and persistent erosion of quality and access to arts education across K-12 public education over the last two decades. This erosion encompasses significant loss in expertise, material resources and dedicated space.

In elementary schools, when imaginative capacities are most crucially formed, there has been a precipitous decline in specialist teachers.^{xvii} Universities and other teacher-accreditation bodies have similarly reduced or eliminated arts education specialist training, particularly at the elementary level. The responsibility for arts education is now placed on generalist teachers, the majority of whom have limited background or training in the arts.^{xviii} According to the 2015/16, less than half of grade 4 and 7 students across the province indicated that they were learning about art or music.^{xix} Loss of quality, knowledge-based arts education at the elementary level has had a cumulative impact on the decline in quality and scope of fine and applied arts programming at the secondary level, where arts teachers are already under strain to generalize instruction and maximize class sizes for cost efficiencies.^{xx} Even where specialists are retained, the amount of compulsory time allocated to the arts has been dramatically reduced; in elementary, arts specialists are now prep time teachers and in secondary, the number of required fine and applied art graduation credits have been reduced by 75%.^{xxi} Once the new 2018 graduation guidelines take effect, students will no longer need a single fine or applied arts course to graduate. This decline in specialized time and instruction has resulted in a corresponding loss of art and music rooms.

Schools across the province are being rebuilt and seismically retrofitted to conform to Ministry Area Standards introduced in 2004 that restrict the allowable square footage for new school facilities.^{xxii} This document does not allow space provisions for art, music or performance space within elementary schools. The cost of including this additional square footage would increase the cost of construction by only 2%.^{xxiii} Dedicated space that can accommodate the materials, equipment and spatial arrangements for engagement in the arts is essential to quality programming. Without intervention, arts education will be structurally and systematically eliminated within the public school system for the next generation and beyond.

Inequities Result from the Erosion of Arts Education

In the absence of comprehensive, consistent and equitable arts education within public schools, families are outsourcing access to the arts through private lessons and PAC fundraising.^{xxiv} This creates inequity of access to arts education based on socio economic status. Given that aboriginal and immigrant families are disproportionately represented within disadvantaged populations^{xxv}, and that the arts are shown (through longitudinal studies) to correlate with improved life outcomes for at-risk youth^{xxvi} in academic achievement, employment opportunities and civic engagement, the loss of arts programming in schools should be a matter of grave concern.

The evacuation of arts programming at all levels within our public education system has reached a critical juncture. A quality arts education is essential for the economic prosperity and health of our society. Although the BC government, underscored by the evidence of arts organizations across BC,^{xxvii} acknowledges the fundamental importance of the arts for both economic and societal wellbeing, this understanding is not being supported at its most foundational level: our K-12 public education system.^{xxviii} Investment in the creative economy begins by giving every child the opportunity to develop their creative and aesthetic potential within a quality, publicly funded education system. If we acknowledge that the arts are fundamental to human flourishing, and that public education should empower students to be creative and compassionate contributors to the building of a healthy, pluralistic and democratic society, we must ensure that quality arts education is financially supported and protected across K-12 public education.

Therefore, to fulfill its responsibility and provide equitable access to a quality arts education as a key element within the K-12 curriculum, we the undersigned, request that the government work to:

- Amend the Ministry Area Standards to ensure that all new school builds have sufficient dedicated space to provide quality arts education for future generations
- Allocate additional, targeted and protected funding to all school districts to enable them to provide the expertise and material resources needed to support a quality arts education for all students

We thank you for your attention and commitment in addressing these issues.

Sincerely,

ArtStarts in Schools

Families Against Cuts to Education

Nanaimo Parents Supporting Public Education

Parent Advocacy Network for Public Education

Public Education Network Society

Richmond Schools Stand United

Simon Fraser University Arts Education Faculty

Surrey Students Now

Doris Auxier, M.A., M.F.A., Associate Professor of Art and Design

Elizabeth Barnes, Faculty of Fine Arts, Kwantlen Polytechnic University

Marie-France Berard, PhD, Lecturer Art Education, University of British Columbia

Sabine Bitter, Associate Professor, School for the Contemporary Arts, Simon Fraser University

Elizabeth Volpe Bligh, UBC School of Music, VSO School of Music, President West Coast Harp Society,
retired principal Harp, Vancouver Symphony

David Brown, President, Vancouver Musician's Association, member Vancouver Symphony Orchestra,
Turning Point Ensemble

Dr. Jessica Bushey, Sessional Instructor, Department of Continuing Studies, University of Victoria

Cyndy Chwelos, Faculty Instructor, Recreation Studies, Langara College

Margaret Chrumka, Executive Director, Kamloops Art Gallery

Daniel Cleland, Board Director, Sarah McLachlan Foundation; Sarah McLachlan School of Music

Leslie Dala, Music Director, Vancouver Bach Choir, Associate Conductor, Vancouver Opera

Dr. Terence Dawson, Chair, Keyboard Division, School of Music, University of British Columbia

Dr. Alex de Cosson, Art Education Department of Curriculum and Pedagogy, University of British Columbia

Dr. Jeff Derksen, Dean Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies, Simon Fraser University

Alexander J. Fisher, Professor of Music, University of British Columbia

Judith Forst, OC, OBC.

Kenneth Friedman, Double Bass Instructor, School of Music, University of British Columbia

Paula Funk, Coordinator, Completion Advising, University of the Fraser Valley

Jesse Adam Garbe, Sessional Instructor Visual Arts, Emily Carr University of Art and Design

Robert Gelineau, Fine Arts Instructor, Kwantlen Polytechnic University

Leila Getz, C. M., O.B.C., D.F.A, Founder and Director, Vancouver Recital Society

Katherine Gillieson, PhD, Associate Professor, Communication Design, Emily Carr University of Art and
Design

J. Scott Goble, Ph.D. Associate Professor of Music Education, University of British Columbia

Ana Gomes (Black), BC Artist and Fine Art Instructor, Kwantlen Polytechnic University

Frances Grafton, Sessional Instructor, Emily Carr University of Art and Design

Dr. Wendy Grant, Coordinator, Music Diploma program, Capilano University

Dr. Erica L. Grimm, Associate Professor of Art, School of the Arts, Media + Culture, Trinity Western
University

Joshua Hale, Chair and Assistant Professor, Art + Design, School of the Arts, Media + Culture, Trinity
Western University

Dr. Keith Hamel, Professor of Composition, School of Music, University of British Columbia

Prof. Nancy Hermiston, O.C., Head, Voice and Opera Divisions and University Marshal, University of British
Columbia

Nathan Hesselink, Chair and Professor, Ethnomusicology, University of British Columbia

Jaz Holloran, Sessional Instructor, Communication Design, Design and Dynamic Media, Emily Carr
University of Art and Design

Keiko Honda, PhD., MPH, President and Executive Director, Vancouver Arts Colloquium Society

Dr. Rita Irwin, Distinguished University Scholar and Professor, Art Education, University of British
Columbia

Gail Johnson, General Manager, Gordon and Marion Smith Foundation for Young Artists

Jaymie Johnson, Sessional Instructor, Emily Carr University of Art and Design

Nané Jordan, Sessional Lecturer, Department of Curriculum and Pedagogy, University of British Columbia

Lizzy Karp, Senior Manager for Distribution, Experiential and Engagement, Telus Storyhive

Richard Kurth, PhD., Professor and Director, School of Music, University of British Columbia

Karen V. Lee, PhD, lecturer and faculty advisor, Faculty of Education, University of British Columbia

Dr. Jillian Lerner, Sessional Instructor, Culture and Community, Emily Carr University of Art and Design
Donald Lawrence, Professor, Department of Visual and Performing Arts, Thompson Rivers University
Christin Reardon MacLellan, Coalition for Music Education in BC
Paul Martin, Producer, Next Level Games Inc.
Pia Massie, Artist, Designer, Scholar in Residence, Culture and Community Faculty, Emily Carr University of Art and Design
Colleen Maybin, Director of Education and Community Engagement, Vancouver Opera
Sarah McLachlan, Board Director, Sarah McLachlan Foundation; Sarah McLachlan School of Music
Julia Nolan, PhD., Saxophone Faculty, Kwantlen Polytechnic University, University of British Columbia
Maria Anna Parolin, Vice President, Burnaby Arts Council; Fine Art Instructor, Kwantlen Polytechnic University
Alec Pearson, Sessional Instructor, University of British Columbia; President, Vancouver Classic Guitar Society
Lorelei Pepi, Associate Professor, Animation, Emily Carr University of Art and Design
Magnolia Pauker, Lecturer, Faculty of Community and Culture, Emily Carr University of Art and Design
Eric Randall, President, Next Level Games Inc.
Helen Reed and Hannah Jickling, Sessional Instructors, Emily Carr University of Art and Design
Bob Rennie, Rennie Foundation
Jayce Salloum, BC Artist, Governor General Award recipient
Alison Shields, Assistant Teaching Professor, Art Education, University of Victoria
Michael Tenzer, Professor and Graduate Advisor, School of Music, University of British Columbia
Bramwell Tovey O.C., Music Director, Vancouver Symphony Orchestra
Cheyanne Turions, Curator and Writer
Lisa Turner, Trustee, Vancouver Art Gallery
Jen Weih, Itinerant Faculty, Emily Carr University of Art and Design
Alexander Weimann
Rita Wong, Associate Professor, Emily Carr University of Art and Design
Tara Wren, Lecturer, Critical and Cultural Studies, Emily Carr University of Art and Design

CC:

Hon John Horgan, Premier, BC NDP
Hon Carole James, Minister of Finance and Deputy Premier
Hon Andrew Wilkinson, Leader of the Opposition, BC Liberal Leader
Hon Andrew Weaver, BC Green Leader
Hon Dan Davies, BC Liberal Spokesperson for Education
Hon Mary Polak, BC Liberal Spokesperson for Education
Hon Sonia Furstenuau, BC Green Spokesperson for Education
Hon Bob D'Eith, Chair, Select Standing Committee on Finance & Government Services
Hon Dan Ashton, Deputy Chair, Select Standing Committee on Finance & Government Services
Jen Mezei, President, BCCPAC
Gordon Swan, President, BCSTA
Glen Hansman, President, BCTF
Tom Longridge, President, BCSSA
Kevin Reimer, President, BCPVP

Appendix: Supporting Evidence

Arts Education is essential for building a healthy, pluralistic and democratic society:

Arts Education develops aesthetic and imaginative capacities for human fulfillment

- The right to engage in cultural production and to enjoy the arts is a fundamental human right. *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*, Article 27, 1949.
<http://www.un.org/en/universal-declaration-human-rights/>
- The arts are an intrinsic part of our human social and emotional experience. Dewey, John. *Art as Experience*. Perigree Books, (1934) 1980; Dessanyake, Ellen. *Homo Aestheticus: Where Art Comes from and Why*. University of Washington Press, 1992.
- The Capability Approach identifies “imagination thought and senses” as well as “play” as one of the 10 capabilities that are the conditions for and indicators for human flourishing in terms of justice and freedom in societies. Kleist, Chad. “Global Ethics: Capabilities Approach.” *Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. <http://www.iep.utm.edu/ge-capab/>

Arts education supports democratic citizenship and promotes intercultural understanding

- Cultivating imagination opens up the empathic, aesthetic, and generative capacity for social transformation. Greene, Maxine. *Releasing the Imagination: Essays on Education, the Arts and Social Change*. Jossey-Bass, 2000.
- Arts education fosters “Imaginative Understanding”, one of the 3 capabilities alongside critical thinking and world citizenship identified by Nussbaum as central to the “cultivation of humanity in today’s interlocking world.” Maguire, Cindy. “The Capabilities Approach and Citizenship Education: What the Arts Have to Offer.” *Prospero: A Journal of New Thinking in the Philosophy of Education* Vol 14, 2008.
- UNESCO has highlighted the important role of arts education in promoting intercultural understanding in a rapidly changing world. *Seoul Agenda: Goals for the Development of Art Education from the Second World Conference on Art Education*, UNESCO, 2010)
- Freedom and opportunity to practice art and culture is a right of Indigenous People. *United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People*, Article 11.
http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/documents/DRIPS_en.pdf
- Art and cultural practices are integral to indigenous ways of knowing; they constitute a foundational literacy through which history, community, spirituality and cultural regeneration is expressed. Access to culturally appropriate curriculum is an educational mandate of the Canadian Truth and Reconciliation Commission. *Truth and Reconciliation Commission Calls to Action*, Item 10.3, 2016.
http://www.trc.ca/websites/trcinstitution/File/2015/Findings/Calls_to_Action_English2.pdf
- Neuroscientists link arts engagement and the attention to other perspectives as key to developing the capacity for empathy in the brain. Bazalgette, Peter. *The Empathy Instinct: How to Create a More Civil Society*. John Murray Publishers, 2017; Bazalgette, *Arts, Culture and Empathy lecture*, January 2017.
http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-file/Arts_culture_empathy_lecture_transcript_Final.pdf; James Catteral, “A Neuroscience of Art and Human Empathy”, (draft) 2011. www.croc-lab.org/uploads/7/9/9/8/7998314/neuroscience-art-empathy.docx

Arts education promotes mental health and well-being

- Mental health issues in young people are on the rise and are a growing concern amongst educators and policy makers. Chai, Carmen. “Why more Canadians than ever are at risk of mental health issues.” *Global News*, May 2017) <https://globalnews.ca/news/3417600/why-more-canadian-millennials-than-ever-are-at-high-risk-of-mental-health-issues/>
- Engagement in the arts are shown to promote mental well-being. Rogers, Natalie. *The Creative Connection: Expressive Arts as Healing*. Palo Alto, Calif: Science & Behaviour Books, 2000; “Everything we know about how and whether the arts Improve our lives,” *Create Equity*, 2011 <http://createequity.com/2016/12/everything-we-know-about-whether-and-how-the-arts-improve-lives/>; “Part of your World: Art and Wellbeing” *Create Equity*, 2015 <http://createequity.com/2015/08/part-of-your-world-on-the-arts-and-wellbeing/>
- Quality arts education increases the expressive capacities and emotional regulation of children who have experienced trauma. *Heart: Healing and education through the arts*. Save the Children.org <http://www.savethechildren.org/atf/cf/%7B9def2ebe-10ae-432c-9bd0-df91d2eba74a%7D/HEART.PDF>
- Evidence-based research demonstrates a relationship between the arts, increased self-confidence, self-worth and resilience or grit. Upitis, Rena. *Arts Education for the Development of the Whole Child*. Kingston: Queens University, 2011; Hetland, Winner, Veenema and Sheridan, *Studio Thinking 2: The Real Benefits of Visual Arts Education*. Harvard University Press, 2013; Varghese, Sheena. "Guidelines for Teaching Art to Students from Urban High-Poverty Backgrounds." *Thesis*, Georgia State University, 2015. https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/art_design_theses/177/
- High arts engagement has a strong correlation with improved life outcomes for disadvantaged youth in academic achievement, employment opportunity and civic engagement. *The Arts and Achievement in At-Risk Youth: Findings from Four Longitudinal Studies*, National Endowment for the Arts, 2012. <https://www.arts.gov/sites/default/files/Arts-At-Risk-Youth.pdf>

Arts education respects multiple intelligences and allows for inclusive learning

- Education in the arts honours and supports the development of multiple intelligences. Gardner, Howard. “The Happy Meeting of Multiple Intelligences and the Arts.” *Harvard Education Letter* Vol. 5.6, 1999. http://hepg.org/hel-home/issues/15_6/helarticle/the-happy-meeting-of-multiple-intelligences-and-th
- Arts education reaches students that are hard to reach. Kreger Silverman, Linda. “At-risk Youth and the Creative Process,” *Gifted Development Centre*. <http://www.gifteddevelopment.com/visual-spatial/risk-youth-and-creative-process>; Fiske Edward B., Ed. *Champions of Change: The Impact of the Arts on Learning*, Arts Education Partnership, 1999. <http://artsedge.kennedy-center.org/champions/pdfs/champsreport.pdf>
- The arts are shown to increase academic engagement and achievement for children with learning disabilities and for ELL students. Menzer, Melisa. *The Arts in Early Childhood: Social and Emotional Benefits of arts*, National Endowment for the Arts, 2015. <https://www.arts.gov/sites/default/files/arts-in-early-childhood-dec2015-rev.pdf>

- Education in the arts enhances the underlying brain processes that support learning; sensory, attentional, cognitive emotional, motor. Jensen, Eric. *Arts with the Brain in Mind*, Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, 2001.
- Learning through the arts improves academic achievement for all children. Fowler. "Strong Arts Strong schools: The promising potential and short-sighted disregard of the arts in American schooling", *Educational Leadership: Strategies for Success* 52.3. Oxford University Press, 1996; Upitit, 2002.

Arts Education is essential for building a prosperous and sustainable economy:

Creativity is a key skill for the 21st century economy

- Creativity is widely recognized by business and educational leaders as the primary skill set needed for the 21st century economy. *Creativity Unleashed: Taking Creativity out of the Laboratory and into the Labour Force*, 2011-2012 Action Canada Task Force Report, 2012. <http://www.actioncanada.ca/wp-content/uploads/2014/04/AC-TF3-Creativity-Report-EN-web.pdf>; *Ready to Innovate*, Conference Board, 2008. <https://www.americansforthearts.org/sites/default/files/ReadytoInnovateFull.pdf>; *Policy Research Group*; *The Creative Economy: Concepts and Literature Review Highlights*, May 2013. https://cch.novascotia.ca/sites/default/files/inline/documents/creative-economy-synthesis_201305.pdf
- The Torrance Test of Creative Thinking has shown a steady decline in creativity across all metrics since 1990 Kim, Kyumg Hee. "The Creativity Crisis: The Decrease in Creative Thinking Scores on the Torrance Test of Creative Thinking." *Creativity Research Journal* Nov. 2011. https://www.nesacenter.org/uploaded/conferences/SEC/2013/handouts/Kim_Creativity-Crisis_CRJ2011.pdf
- Canada's global competitiveness is compromised by declining innovation capacity according to recent World Economic Forum results. "Poor Innovation Ranking Dims the Light on Canada's Competitiveness and Prosperity," *Conference Board of Canada*, 2012. http://www.conferenceboard.ca/press/newsrelease/12-09-27/Poor_Innovation_Ranking_Dims_the_Lights_on_Canada_s_Compitiveness_and_Prosperty.aspx?AspxAutoDetectCookieSupport=1
- Canada ranks 24 out of 28 countries and well behind the OECD average for compulsory arts as a percentage of instructional time for 9-11 year-olds. Winner and Vincent-Pancrin, *Art for Art's Sake? The Impact of Arts Education*, OECD, 2013. <http://www.oecd.org/education/cei/arts.htm>
- PISA is redesigning its international test to reflect the need for assessing creativity, Romer, Christy. "Creativity in Schools to be Compared across the World." *Arts Professional* Jan. 2018. <https://www.artsprofessional.co.uk/news/creativity-schools-be-compared-across-world>

Arts education is key for developing the skill set for creativity and innovation

- Fine Arts and Communications graduates are most likely to possess the divergent thinking skills needed for creativity and innovation. Conference Board, 2008; Policy Research Group, 2013.
- Preliminary results from STEM education initiatives in North America have not demonstrated improvement in creativity or divergent thinking. Integrating the arts stimulates innovation and

creativity. Sousa, David and Tom Pilecki. *From STEM to STEAM: Using Brain-Compatible Strategies to Integrate the Arts*. Corwin, 2013.

- Companies that integrate arts with sciences outperform companies that do not, in both innovation and growth. Cultural Learning Alliance. *STEAM: Why STEM can take us only so far*. Briefing Paper, 2013. <https://culturallearningalliance.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/CD405-CLA-STEAM-Briefing-Teachers-Notes-08.pdf>
- Participation in the arts develops creative habits of mind. Hetland, Winner, Veenema and Sheridan, *Studio Thinking 2: The Real Benefits of Visual Arts Education*, Harvard U P, 2013; Winner and Vincent Pancrin, *Art for Art's Sake? The Impact of Arts Education*, OECD, 2013; *Neuroeducation: Learning, Arts and the Brain: Findings and Challenges for Educators and Researchers from the 2009 John Hopkins University Summit*, Dana Foundation, 2009. https://www.giarts.org/sites/default/files/Neuroeducation_Learning-Arts-and-the-Brain.pdf
- The arts act as a catalyst for innovative thinking across all economic sectors.
- Neuroscientists are linking increased emphasis on technology to the decrease in right brain capacities that include creativity, empathy and big picture thinking. McGilchrist, Iain. *The Master and his Emissary: The Divided Brain and the Making of the Western World*. Yale University Press, 2009.
- *The Select Standing Committee Report on the Budget 2018 Consultations* recommends that government make an investment in K-12 education in the arts to support BC's creative economy. https://www.leg.bc.ca/content/CommitteeDocuments/41st-parliament/2nd-session/FGS/Budget2018Consultation/FGS_2017-11-15_Budget2018Consultation_Report.pdf

Arts education is relevant for critical engagement in today's public communication sphere

- Multimedia technologies have transformed the sphere of public communications and engagement in today's world. Scott McMaster, *Visual Literacy and Art Education: A Review of the Literature*, 2015. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/280319601_Visual_Literacy_and_Art_Education_Review_of_the_Literature
- As early as 1987, an estimated 85% of the information absorbed on a daily basis is visual rather than textual. McMaster, 2015.
- Students must develop visual literacy and a critical understanding of how imagery shapes and informs our values and beliefs. Bamford, Ann. *The Visual Literacy White Paper*. Adobe Systems Inc., 2003. <https://www.aperture.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/05/visual-literacy-wp.pdf>; Oring, Stuart. "A Call for Visual Literacy," *The Free Library*. Davis Publications, Inc. 2000. <https://www.thefreelibrary.com/A+CALL+FOR+VISUAL+LITERACY.-a061524607>

The arts and culture sector is an important and growing part of BC's economy

- The United Nations has identified the creative economy as one of the world's fastest growing sectors for income generation, job creation and export earnings. Government of British Columbia, *Factsheet: Arts, Culture and the Creative Economy* 2018. <https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/arts-culture-and-the-creative-economy>
- Arts and culture are an important indicator of economic competitiveness and growth in leading economies. *Otis Report on the Creative Economy*. Los Angeles Economic Development Corporation, 2017. <https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/sports-culture/arts-culture/facts-and-stats>

- Investment in the arts yields positive returns of up to ten times when accounting for direct, indirect and induced benefits. *A Strategic and economic business case for investment in the arts*, Business for the Arts, 2009. <http://www.businessforthearts.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/02/BftA-business-case-for-funding-the-arts.pdf>
- BC's total culture GDP in 2014 was 3% of BC's GDP or about \$6.7 billion, a \$1 billion increase since 2010. Government of British Columbia, *Arts and Culture Facts and Stats*, 2018. <https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/sports-culture/arts-culture/facts-and-stats>. Statistics Canada data released February 2018 shows BC's total culture GDP to have grown to \$7.2 billion. Statistics Canada, *Provincial and Territorial Culture Indicators*, 2016, Feb. 2018. <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/daily-quotidien/180227/dq180227a-eng.htm>
- More British Columbians participate in art and culture related activities than citizens of other province Hill, Kelly. *Findings of background research in the state of British Columbia Arts and Culture*, Feb 2016. https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5266d49be4b0bc5cd29ee8e0/t/56c49cf2e321405712151c85/1455725812351/Alliance1_background.pdf
- BC has the highest concentration of artists and cultural workers in Canada. Hill, 2016. The growth in culture sector jobs was 7.1% in 2016 from the previous year, compared to a 4.1% increase economy wide. Statistics Canada, *Provincial and Territorial Culture Indicators*, 2016, Feb. 2018. <http://www.statcan.gc.ca/daily-quotidien/180227/dq180227a-eng.htm>

ⁱ Preamble, *BC School Act* http://www.bclaws.ca/civix/document/LOC/complete/statreg/--%20S%20--/05_School%20Act%20%5BRBC%201996%5D%20c.%20412/00_Act/96412_01.xml

ⁱⁱ In the 2015/6 satisfaction survey, only 41% of grade 3/4 students and 33% of Grade 7 students responded with “many times” to the question “At school are you learning about art?” In the same survey, only 53% of grade 3/4 students and 43% of grade 7 students responded “many times” to the question “At school, are you learning about music?” Government of British Columbia, *Satisfaction Survey*, 2015/16 http://www.bced.gov.bc.ca/reports/pdfs/sat_survey/public.pdf The satisfaction survey of 2016/17 has eliminated these questions and replaced them with “At school, are you learning to be creative?”

ⁱⁱⁱ *Seoul Agenda: Goals for the Development of Arts Education*, 2010 http://www.unesco.org/fileadmin/multimedia/HQ/CLT/CLT/pdf/Seoul_Agenda_EN.pdf

^{iv} *BC's New Curriculum* <https://curriculum.gov.bc.ca/competencies> and Hetland, Winner, Veenema, Sheridan, *Studio Thinking 2: The Real Benefits of Visual Arts Education*, 2013. See also Studio Thinking at Harvard University's Project Zero, <http://www.pz.harvard.edu/projects/the-studio-thinking-project>

^v *C21 Shifting Minds: Redefining the Learning Landscape in Canada*, C21 Canada, May 2015 <http://www.c21canada.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/C21-ShiftingMinds-3.pdf> and World Economic Forum, *The Future of Jobs: Employment, Skills and Workforce Strategy for the Fourth Industrial Revolution*, 2016 and Mariale Hardiman, Susan Magsamen, Guy McKann and Janet Eilber, *Neuroeducation: Learning, Arts and the Brain: Findings and Challenges for Educators and Researchers from the 2009 John Hopkins University Summit*, The Dana Foundation, 2009 https://www.gjarts.org/sites/default/files/Neuroeducation_Learning-Arts-and-the-Brain.pdf

-
- ^{vi} Winner and Vincent-Pancrin, *Art for Art's Sake? The Impact of Arts Education*, OECD, 2013
<http://www.oecd.org/education/ceeri/arts.htm>
- ^{vii} "Poor Innovation Ranking Dims the Light on Canada's Competitiveness and Prosperity," *Conference Board of Canada*, 2012
- ^{viii} Scott McMaster, *Visual Literacy and Art Education: A Review of the Literature*, 2015
https://www.researchgate.net/publication/280319601_Visual_Literacy_and_Art_Education_Review_of_the_Literature
- ^{ix} Ann Bamford, *The Visual Literacy White Paper*, Adobe Systems Inc., 2003
<https://www.aperture.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/05/visual-literacy-wp.pdf>
- ^x Ellen Winner, Goldstein and Vincent Lancrin, *Art for Art's Sake? The Impact of Arts Education*, OECD Centre for Educational Research and Innovation, 2013 <http://www.oecd.org/edu/ceeri/arts.htm>; National Endowment for the Arts, *The Arts in Early Childhood : Social and Emotional Benefits of Arts Participation*, 2015 <https://www.arts.gov/art-works/2015/looking-social-and-emotional-benefits-arts>; "Everything we know about how and whether the arts improve our lives;" Create Equity, 2017 <http://createequity.com/2016/12/everything-we-know-about-whether-and-how-the-arts-improve-lives/>
- ^{xi} Peter Bazalgette, *The Empathy Instinct: How to Create a More Civil Society*, John Murray Publishers, 2017 and James Catterall, "A Neuroscience of Art and Human Empathy", (draft) 2011. www.croc-lab.org/uploads/7/9/9/8/7998314/neuroscience-art-empathy.docx ; See also Erica Grimm Vance, "The Aesthetics of Attentiveness: A Philosophy for Artists and Educators", PhD dissertation, SFU, 2015.
- ^{xii} *Seoul Agenda: Goals for the Development of Arts Education*, 2010
http://www.unesco.org/fileadmin/multimedia/HQ/CLT/CLT/pdf/Seoul_Agenda_EN.pdf
- ^{xiii} Capabilities Approach developed by Amartya Sen and refined by Martha Nussbaum, "Capabilities and Human Rights", *Fordham Law Review* 66.2 (1997); <http://www.iep.utm.edu/ge-capab/4> and <http://www.iep.utm.edu/ge-capab/9>
- ^{xiv} *United Nations Declaration of Human Rights* Article 27; <http://www.un.org/en/universal-declaration-human-rights/>
- ^{xv} Government of British Columbia, Ministry of Education, *First Peoples Principles of Learning* https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/education/kindergarten-to-grade-12/teach/teaching-tools/aboriginal-education/principles_of_learning.pdf; *United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People* ratified by Canada in 2016, Article 11 http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/documents/DRIPS_en.pdf
- ^{xvi} *Truth and Reconciliation Commission: Calls to Action*, Item 10.3
http://www.trc.ca/websites/trcinstitution/File/2015/Findings/Calls_to_Action_English2.pdf
- ^{xvii} In Vancouver, the loss of specialized arts education training for elementary teachers in universities, and the loss of specialist positions within elementary schools has decimated the number of arts education teachers with specialization in these areas. Using anecdotal evidence from interviews with former district principals and 2015 statistics, approximately 85% of music specialists and 98% of art specialists in Vancouver have been lost over the last 2 decades. *Parent Advocacy Network Answers to Questions on Notice from the Select Standing Committee on Finance and Government Services*, 2015/16.

<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1cqpz6lkYVvLyYp8vmVncBZ79bQmRKKFd/view> According to 2017 a survey of arts teachers in the Vancouver School District, only 30 of the 90 elementary schools in Vancouver have a full-time K-7 music teacher, 27 have part time music teachers and 33 schools have no music teacher. Only 2 elementary schools have a K-7 art teacher for the 2017 school year. *Parent Advocacy Network Answers to Questions on Notice from the Select Standing Committee on Finance and Government Services*, 2015/16.

^{xviii} No prerequisites in the arts (visual or performing) are required for admission to the teacher accreditation program at UBC <http://teach-educ.sites.olt.ubc.ca/files/2017/11/Elementary-Middle-Years-Worksheet-2018.pdf> or SFU <http://www.sfu.ca/education/teachersed/programs/pdp/admissions-requirements/elementary.html>. See also Lisa LaJevic, "Arts Integration: What is Really Happening in the Elementary Classroom", *Journal for Learning through the Arts*, 9(1), 2013. <http://escholarship.org/uc/item/9qt3n8xt>

^{xix} In the 2015/6 satisfaction survey, only 41% of grade 3/4 students and 33% of Grade 7 students responded with "many times" to the question "At school are you learning about art?" In the same survey, only 53% of grade 3/4 students and 43% of grade 7 students responded "many times" to the question "At school, are you learning about music?" Government of British Columbia, *Satisfaction Survey*, 2015/16 http://www.bced.gov.bc.ca/reports/pdfs/sat_survey/public.pdf The satisfaction survey of 2016/17 has eliminated these questions and replaced them with "At school, are you learning to be creative?."

^{xx} It is not uncommon for secondary art classes to accommodate 30 students encompassing grades 8-10 within a single class.

^{xxi} Prior to 2004, all students had to take electives in a fine and applied arts to grade 10 and then at least one fine and one applied arts elective in the graduating years (11 and 12). Now, students need only take one fine or applied arts elective during the graduation years (10-12). This has reduced the number of required electives for the arts by 75%. Government of British Columbia, *Certificate of Graduation – 2004 Graduation Program* <https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/education-training/k-12/support/graduation/certificate-of-graduation-2004> Since 2018, this has decreased further to only one elective of either arts education 10,11, or 12 and/or Applied Design/skills and technologies 10, 11, or 12. It is therefore possible for students to have zero courses in the arts after grade 9. Government of British Columbia, *Certificate of Graduation – 2018 Graduation Program requirements*. <https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/education-training/k-12/support/graduation/certificate-of-graduation> Starting in the 90s, all districts across BC rolled arts specialists into prep time models in order to cut operational expenditures.

^{xxii} Government of British Columbia, *Ministry Area Standards*, 2004. <https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/education/administration/resource-management/capital-planning/areastandards.pdf>

^{xxiii} According to Vancouver architects for the SMP, the unit rate for a typical Vancouver school is between 2,200 and 2,500 m². This is higher than the average provincial unit rate. Two additional rooms of 80m² each would add at most \$400,000 to a construction project. This would be approximately 2% of the cost of the latest project approvals \$22.4 and \$24.5 million for Begbie and Bayview Elementary, equivalent to the additional cost factor of building on a gradient. Vancouver Courier, "Horgan Promises two Earthquake Proof Schools for Vancouver," October 11, 2017. <http://www.vancourier.com/news/horgan-promises-two-earthquake-proof-schools-for-vancouver-1.23062098> Government of British Columbia. *2015/16 Capitol Plan: Allowances, Rates and Costing Factors Supplement*, July 2015

https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/education/administration/resource-management/capital-planning/current-resources/2015-16_cpi_supplement.pdf

^{xxiv} Parent Advocacy Network for Public Education, in Response to Questions on Notice, September 2016 http://www.panvancouver.ca/uploads/6/7/1/4/67145647/pan_response_to_questions_on_notice_select_standing_committee_oct_2016%5B1%5D.pdf and Table of what PAC fundraising pays for across Province , Appendix to *Presentation to the Select Standing Committee on Finance and Government Services, 2017* http://www.panvancouver.ca/uploads/6/7/1/4/67145647/20171006_scc_for_budget_2018_19_f.pdf

^{xxv} According to First Call, 1 in 5 children still live in poverty in BC. <http://still1in5.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/2016-BC-Child-Poverty-Report-Card-Executive-Summary-FirstCall-2017-05.pdf> This is higher in urban centres where 22% of children live in poverty. Iglia Ivanova, *Working Poor in Metro Vancouver*, CCPA, June 2016. Metro Vancouver has the 2nd highest rate of working poor in Canada. 42% of working poor are raising children. The majority are single parents, new or recent immigrants. https://www.policyalternatives.ca/sites/default/files/uploads/publications/BC%20Office/2016/06/CCPA_Working_poverty_full.pdf

^{xxvi} This summary of four longitudinal studies found that children from low socio-economic backgrounds with a high arts exposure came close to and sometimes surpassed inequality gaps with children from more affluent backgrounds in test performances, post-secondary attendance, graduation, volunteer work and civic involvement - including political activity. James S. Catterall, Susan A. Dumais and Gillian Hampden-Thompson, *The Arts and Achievement in At-Risk Youth: Findings from Four Longitudinal Studies*, National Endowment for the Arts, March 2012. <http://arts.gov/sites/default/files/Arts-At-Risk-Youth.pdf>

^{xxvii} Arts Future BC, Presentation to the Select Standing Committee on Finance and Government Services for the 2008 British Columbia Provincial Government Budget; <http://www.artsbc.com/arts-future-bc-report/>

^{xxviii} “Working closely with the cultural sector, we are promoting the value of creativity, encouraging cooperation, and driving innovation, productivity and entrepreneurship. Growing B.C.’s creative economy is attracting new investment and creating new jobs for British Columbians.” Quoted from Government of British Columbia, *Creative Economy*, <https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/sports-culture/arts-culture/creative-economy>