



PAN RECOMMENDATIONS
For the Select Standing Committee on Finance and Government Services
June 12, 2020

Preamble:

In this time of wild uncertainty, constant change and instability, public education has never been more of an essential service necessary to provide an upstream trauma informed mental health and wellness intervention.

COVID has only exacerbated the fault lines of the systemic inequity that intersectional students are victim to. Teachers are being mandated to adapt without adequate training time and resources to complex changes that adequately serve fewer and fewer children. Special needs students are experiencing exclusion at an alarming rate, LGBTQ2S+ and all manner of vulnerable learners impacted by poverty, the consequences of residential schools, systemic racism, growing ACES and cascading trauma are impacted exponentially.

If we are to collectively fight for the rights of a more equitable and healthy society, we must provide a sanctuary for the chronic mental and physical impacts of loneliness that this time brings into stark focus. To protect, enliven and plan for schools as a place of refuge, we must collaboratively amplify the need for a fully funded public education system that provides trauma informed upstream social and emotional wellness interventions for all students and staff to support children as they transition through life.

We must rebuild each school as a safe harbour where ALL students are consistently invited to show up, stay connected and emerge as healthy compassionate world citizens ready to face the evolving complexity and challenges the future holds.



PAN RECOMMENDATIONS

For the Select Standing Committee on Finance and Government Services

June 12, 2020

PAN fully supports and endorses the recommendations from First Call: BC Child and Youth Advocacy Coalition BCCPAC, BC Poverty Reduction Coalition and BCEdAccess.

PAN respectfully resubmits the same following recommendations that were submitted in October 2018 to the Select Standing Committee on Finance and Government Services

Recommendation 1

Per pupil operational funding be increased to ensure the increased costs of service delivery are not downloaded onto districts, resulting in further cuts to educational services for children.

Recommendation 2

Increase supplemental funding to include all special needs, complex learners and vulnerable students to enable districts to create meaningful and comprehensive solutions for improving student success including diagnostic services, training, staffing, resources and class size adjustments, to address the full range of learning needs within any given classroom.

Recommendation 3

That government allocate additional ongoing funding for curriculum implementation to support teacher professional development and the acquisition of educational resources. In addition, it is recommended that government develop and commit to funding a minimum standard for access to technology in order to redress inequities that have accumulated within the system from reliance on fundraising.

Recommendation 4

Provide additional, targeted and protected funding to school districts to support equitable access to quality K-12 arts education through professional development, specialist programming, community engagement and material resources.

Recommendation 5

Increase and *accelerate* capital funding so parents can send their children to neighborhood schools that are well maintained and meet current seismic safety standards. We would like the provincial government and Ministry of Education to honor their commitment to replace high seismic risk schools by 2025/2030.

Recommendation 6

Conduct an Area Standards review to ensure space allocations for new schools align with 21st century teaching and learning principles and the objectives of the redesigned curriculum for optimizing student success.

Institute an immediate increase of at least 10% to current BC Area Standards to allow schools in project definition and design phases to include vital non-enrolling spaces for specialized, hands-on learning across the curriculum including science and the arts.

Ensure that all capital funding through the Ministry of Education is directed to serve the educational needs of K-12 public school students. Community use (NLC) space within schools, while offering vital services for families within the community, should be funded through the Ministry of Children and Families.

Recommendation 7

Government create an Educational Facilities Incentive Fund to allow schools undergoing upgrades or repairs to make structural adaptations to out dated learning environments to create spaces that support inclusive learning and innovative teacher practices in 21st century learning and further the implementation of the redesigned curriculum.



Supporting Evidence and Documents for PAN presentation to the Select Standing Committee on Finance and Government Services, 2019.

BC has a duty to uphold equal opportunity in education:

By Statutory Law

WHEREAS it is the goal of a democratic society to ensure that all its members receive an education that enables them to become literate, personally fulfilled and publicly useful, thereby increasing the strength and contributions to the health and stability of that society;

AND WHEREAS the purpose of the British Columbia school system is to enable all learners to become literate, to develop their individual potential and to acquire the knowledge, skills and attitudes needed to contribute to a healthy, democratic and pluralistic society and a prosperous and sustainable economy

Preamble, BC School Act. Current to June 12, 2019.

http://www.bclaws.ca/civix/document/id/complete/statreg/96412_01

Supreme Court of Canada

The Supreme Court of Canada, in a 2012 ruling, said the B.C. School Act makes clear that all learners have the right to acquire the skills and knowledge needed to contribute to society.

“This is an acknowledgment by the government that the reason children are entitled to an education is that a healthy democracy and economy require their educated contribution. Adequate special education, therefore, is not a dispensable luxury,” the court said. “For those with severe learning disabilities, it is the ramp that provides access to the statutory commitment to education made to all children in British Columbia.”

Supreme Court of Canada Moore Decision, 2012. Moore v. British Columbia (Education), 2012 SCC 61, [2012] 3 S.C.R. 360

<https://scc-csc.lexum.com/scc-csc/scc-csc/en/item/12680/index.do>

Commitment by Canadian Ministers of Education in Canada

“With a strong legislative and policy framework that prohibits discrimination in education, the education systems have moved toward widely inclusive education in which all are able to participate and succeed to the best of their abilities... Educational jurisdictions in Canada are reaching beyond the idea of discrimination to the concept of truly inclusive education. In inclusive education, educational values and beliefs are centred on the best interests of the students, promoting social cohesion, belonging, equal opportunities for success, and active participation in learning.”

CMEC, Promoting Equality of Educational Equality, UNESCO international convention against Discrimination in Education, 2012 p. 2 and 14.



“However, the provincial and territorial governments remain very committed to programs that ensure equal access for all.... This is an example of the funding that ministries and departments of education provide so that elementary and secondary education is free to all and that those in need of extra services do not suffer from discrimination whether in access to education or the opportunity to achieve and succeed.”

CMEC, Development of Education Reports Canada, 2008.

<http://www.cmec.ca/Publications/Lists/Publications/Attachments/122/ICE2008-reports-canada.en.pdf>

Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Article 26.

(1) Everyone has the right to education. Education shall be free, at least in the elementary and fundamental stages. Elementary education shall be compulsory. Technical and professional education shall be made generally available and higher education shall be equally accessible to all on the basis of merit.

(2) Education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and to the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms. It shall promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations, racial or religious groups, and shall further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace.

(3) Parents have a prior right to choose the kind of education that shall be given to their children.

The number of Special Needs and Complex Learners in BC public schools is far greater than current funding can support

Government statistics of students with formal special needs designations are constant at around 10.5%. In 2017/18 special needs students represented 11% of public school children.

Inclusive Education and Special Needs in BC Fact Sheet, BCTF, Updated 2019.

<https://bctf.ca/publications.aspx?id=49000>

Only 50% of students identified with learning challenges qualify for supplemental funding

For example, 2015/6 (last publicly available dataset) 5,087 students in Vancouver were formally designated with special needs. Of those, only 2,376 received supplemental funding through the current funding formula.

Student Statistics SD#39 2015/16, Ministry of Education, January 2016

<https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/education/administration/kindergarten-to-grade-12/reports/student-stats/039.pdf>

Final Operating Grant Full-Year Summary 2015/6 School Year, School District 39 Vancouver, PDF.

<https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/education/administration/resource-management/k12funding/15-16/15-16-sd39.pdf>



Number of Classes in BC with 4 or more students entitled to an Individual Education Plan remains high.

In 2007, 1.9% of Grade k-3 classes and 16.6% of Grade 3-12 classes had 4 or more students with Individual Education Plan. In 2016/17 (last publicly available dataset) 3.6% of Grade K-3 classrooms and 27% of Grade 4-12 classrooms had 4 or more students entitled to an Individual Education Plan. This is up slightly from 2015/16.

BC Reports, Overview of Class Size and Composition in BC Public Schools 2016/17.

Educational Assistants in BC schools working unpaid hours to ensure safety and wellbeing of students.

“The primary reasons cited by EAs for performing unpaid work centre around professional concerns for the wellbeing, needs and safety of their students, and the lack of adequate time to meet these needs to a high professional standard. “

John Malcolmson, Recognition and Respect: Recognizing the unpaid work of Educational Assistants in BC, 2008. http://d3n8a8pro7vhm.cloudfront.net/cupebcvotes2014/legacy_url/388/ea_report_final-web_0.pdf?1460990096

Percentage of students receiving some form of special assistance is in school greater than the percentage of children formally identified.

In Ontario, the total percentage of students identified as exceptional was 8.8% of the school population. This figure does not, take into account the large number of students who receive special education programs and services without being formally identified. In total, 17.3% of students in Ontario received some special education programs and/or services in 2015-16.

Canadian Survey on Disability, Learning Disabilities association of Ontario, (2009)2018.
<http://www.ldao.ca/introduction-to-ldsadhd/articles/about-lds/learning-disabilities-statistics/>

National Centre for Educational Statistics shows that since 2004/5 the percentage of students enrolled in public schools receiving special education has risen from 11 to 13 percent.

Special Ed Epidemic: What is Happening to our Children, Focus for Health, October 2017
<https://www.focusforhealth.org/special-ed/>

The landscape of children requiring extra supports in schools is changing.

Incidents of developmental disabilities in children are increasing markedly
Canada has very little information on the prevalence of developmental disabilities.
According to the US National Healthy Interview Survey Datasets, The Number of children with developmental disabilities increased by 15.6% from 2001 to 2011 and by 20.9% for children with neurodevelopmental or mental health conditions.

Ontario Association on Developmental Disabilities, Estimating the Prevalence of Children who have a developmental disability and live in the Province of British Columbia,
Journal on Developmental Disabilities, Vo. 23.3, 2018.



Data on prevalence of neurodevelopmental disorders in US reported to be 15% with pediatricians and educators reporting a rise in the number of children with behavioral learning disorders in the classroom.

“Neurodevelopmental Disorders”, Americas Children and the Environment, October 2015
https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2015-10/documents/ace3_neurodevelopmental.pdf

Number of children with chronic health conditions has doubled over the last two decades

According to US statistics the percentage of children with chronic health conditions in the US rose from 12.8 in 1994 to 26.6 percent in 2006 including ADHD and mental illness.

Special Ed Epidemic: What is Happening to our Children, Focus for Health, October 2017
<https://www.focusforhealth.org/special-ed/> and graphic https://www.focusforhealth.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/Chronic_Illness_in_US_Children_FINAL_3-3-2016.pdf?gclid=COqN84GvyNYCFRtXDQodRI0LIg-

Prevalence of Mental Health conditions is increasing amongst children and youth

The percentage of Children and youth receiving outpatient care for mental health issues increased from 9.2 percent in 1996-8 to 13.3% in 2010-12 according to national survey data in the US.

Olfson, M., Druss, B. G., Marcus, S. C. (2015). Trends in mental health care among children and adolescents. *New England Journal of Medicine*, 372, 2029-2038.
<https://www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/NEJMsa1413512>

Canadian data on mental health in children and youth is lacking.

The Canadian Mental Health commission identified children and youth as an area of mental health that required more data and understanding.

https://www.mentalhealthcommission.ca/sites/default/files/2017-05/Overview_on_Mental_Health_Data_in_Canada.pdf

Prevalence of disabilities in Aboriginal children is double the national average.

Douglas Durst, Urban Aboriginal Families of Children with Disabilities: Social Inclusion or Exclusion, National Association of Friendship Centres, February 2016.

<https://indigenousworks.ca/sites/ahrc/files/attachments/Report-NAFC-Disability.pdf>

Trauma is a major factor effecting learning for children and youth in classrooms.

More than two thirds of children report experiencing a traumatic event by the age of 16.

Trauma-Informed Schools for Children K-12.A System Framework, National Child Traumatic Stress Network,

https://www.nctsn.org/sites/default/files/resources/fact-sheet/trauma_informed_schools_for_children_in_k-12_a_systems_framework.pdf

National Survey on Children’s Health reported that 47 percent of all children in the United States **have experienced at least one adverse childhood experience**, or ACE, such as abuse or neglect, the death of a parent, or witnessing community violence in school or in the neighborhood. Nearly 22 percent of all children have two or more ACEs.

<https://www.edweek.org/ew/articles/2018/02/26/student-trauma-is-widespread-schools-dont-have-to-go-alone.html>



Poverty is a significant barrier in access to learning

Current funding and resources are inadequate to meet the educational needs of students who live in poverty.

BCTF, 2012 Poverty and Education Survey: A teachers' perspective, 2012.

https://www.bctf.ca/uploadedFiles/Public/SocialJustice/Issues/Poverty/Research/Executive_Summary.pdf

[https://bctf.ca/uploadedFiles/Public/SocialJustice/Issues/Poverty/Research/BCTF_Poverty and Education Survey--Chapter 5.pdf](https://bctf.ca/uploadedFiles/Public/SocialJustice/Issues/Poverty/Research/BCTF_Poverty_and_Education_Survey--Chapter_5.pdf)

1 in 5 children still live in poverty in BC.

The *2018 BC Child Poverty Report Card* released by First Call: BC Child and Youth Advocacy Coalition reveals that 1 in 5 children in British Columbia are still growing up in poverty.

First Call, The 2018 BC Child Poverty Report Card, 2018.

<https://firstcallbc.org/child-poverty-report-cards/>

Insufficient supports in schools for children with special needs can have damaging impacts on children.

Of the respondents to a 2015 parent survey, 51% of parents that had children with special needs indicated that they had chosen or been forced to remove their child from public education. The one reason given (69%) was the deteriorating emotional health of their child (anxiety or depression) due to lack of support. This statement was also the number one reason given (60%) by the families who are considering leaving.

“In a developed Province such as British Columbia, we all should be concerned that our current educational system can cause irreparable harm to self-esteem, along with PTSD and in some cases even thoughts of suicide for children with special needs.”

BC Ed. Access, Are BC Public Schools Forcing Student with Special Needs Out? Full Report, 2015.

<https://equitableaccesstoeducation.wordpress.com/full-forced-out-survey-report/>

“B.C. among provinces not doing enough for students with disabilities, United Nations says

<https://globalnews.ca/news/5283914/bc-students-with-disabilities-united-nations/>

BC Public education should support equity in the quality of education.

BC rates poorly compared to other provinces in funding for public education

Education Funding is still decreasing as a percentage of government spending. Funding for B.C.'s students as a share of GDP has dropped by 25% over the last 15 years. There is a significant drop in the share of our total economic resources dedicated to public education, from 3.3% of our province's GDP in 2001 to a projected 2.5% in Budget 2016. If we look only at the actual operating grants the province sends to school boards (excluding other expenses like new school construction and funding for the Ministry of Education itself), the drop is just as sharp, falling from 2.8% of GDP in 2001 to 1.9% in Budget 2016.⁵

This decline in the share of GDP dedicated to education funding represents about \$2 billion per year if we wanted to simply dedicate the same proportion of our economic pie to K–12 education today as we did 15 years ago. This trend continues.

<https://www.policynote.ca/education-crisis/>

Increases in funding to BC Education are mandated cost pressures and do not improve the quality of educational services in BC

New funding in 2019/20 and in the forecast budgets is due to enrolment growth, restored teacher collective agreement language on class size and class composition or previously-agreed-to salary increases. These are all non-discretionary factors over which the Ministry has no control.

<https://bctf.ca/publications/ResearchReports.aspx?id=53519>

Government does not support parent fundraising for items that should be covered by public education funding.

The government fundraising guideline states “Funds raised for school purposes:

- should not be used to replace public funding for education.
- should not be used to support items funded through the allocated budget of a school board, including but not limited to, learning materials and textbooks or capital projects that increase operating costs.”

<http://www.edu.gov.on.ca/eng/parents/fundraisingGuideline.pdf>

Parents are fundraising for essential materials, resources and instruction in schools that is not provided through public funding.

“In 2013, the Vancouver District Parent Advisory Council surveyed 110 individual PACs on fundraising. Eighty-three per cent said their schools didn't have enough money for school programs, while 71 per cent said they fundraised more than \$10,000 for their school a year, for things like playgrounds, library books, field trips, and art and music classes.

<https://thetyee.ca/News/2015/03/06/Vancouver-School-Fundraising/>

PAN survey on parent fundraising for the Select Standing Committee in 2016 consistently revealed that parents across 11 school districts were raising money for essential resources, technologies, furniture, musical instruments, and instruction in art, music, physical education and sexual education.

PAN parent survey, 2016. See appendix A



Loss of specialists to prep time have severely impacted access to quality and breadth of instruction in elementary schools particularly in the arts.

In 2014/15 Satisfaction Survey only 42% of grade 3/4 students and 34% of grade 7 students responded affirmatively to the question “At school, are you learning about art?” This is a decline from 45% and 36% five years prior.

In music, 52% of grade 3/4s and 42% of grade 7 students responded affirmatively to the question “At school, are you learning about music? This represents a slight increase from 51% and 41% five years prior. There was no question about either drama or dance. In 2016/17, questions about art and music were replaced by “In school are you learning to be creative”

http://www.bced.gov.bc.ca/reports/pdfs/sat_survey/public.pdf

The ARTS have been decimated in BC over the last 30 years

Anecdotal evidence gathered from veteran teachers and former district principals in Vancouver reveal that elementary specialist teachers in arts education (both specialist classroom teachers and k-7 specialist teachers) have been reduced from around 300 to around 50 in music and in from around 200 to 2. The loss of visual and performing arts district principals in 1992 and the dismantling of the studio arts education program at UBC have also contributed significantly to this predicament.

PAN Questions on notice to the Select Standing Committee on Finance and Government Services, 2015
[Response to Questions on Notice 2015](#)

PAN talks to the Georgia Straight about the loss of arts specialists and supports in Vancouver and across the province.

<https://www.straight.com/arts/674731/parent-advocacy-network-public-education-will-plead-vs-trustees-renewed-arts-education>

Spaces for the arts are being eliminated in new and existing schools

The government area standards policy (2004) that determines space allocation for new builds (and also determines capacity calculations for existing schools) does not include any provision for art, music or performing space in elementary schools. The Area standards for high schools limits space for specialized classrooms in the arts and applied skills and does not provide space allocations for an auditorium or stage.

<http://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/education/administration/resource-management/capital-planning/areastandards.pdf>

PAN presented a brief calling for an Area Standards review in October 2018.

PAN showed that BC ranks lowest in per student space allocations for both instructional space and gross floor area. We are still waiting for a review to occur.

http://www.panvancouver.ca/uploads/6/7/1/4/67145647/181015_pan_brief_on_area_standards.pdf

The Arts are an essential component of education

The arts are part of the BC core curriculum and essential for the development of core competencies in creative thinking, critical thinking, communication, and personal and social understanding and responsibility. They are crucial for developing citizens with the skill sets and attitudes that contribute to a strong democracy and prosperous economy.

See Appendix B



Arts leaders across the province recognize the erosion of the arts within public education

In March 2018, 71 parent advocate groups, arts education faculty and arts professionals across BC send a petition letter to the Minister of Education urging the government to protect arts education through targeted funding and changes to the area standards policy.

https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/education/administration/resource-management/k12funding/funding-model-review/stakeholder-perspectives-and-reports/parent_advocacy_network_for_public_education_fmr_submission_arts_education.pdf

ARTS advocacy in BC has fallen on deaf ears

Despite evidence-based research and longitudinal studies that show the positive impact of the arts on academic success, graduation rates, employment opportunities, school community and student wellbeing, policy makers in BC have not created policies or initiatives to restore and protect arts education in schools.

Other provinces, notably New Brunswick are working with arts professionals to increase funding to restore the quality of arts education to help prepare students for the 21st century economy.

<https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/new-brunswick/artslink-nb-arts-education-report-1.5047031>

PAN has presented evidence for 5 successive years to the Select Standing committee on Finance and Government Services that the arts in public education are endangered.

http://www.panvancouver.ca/uploads/6/7/1/4/67145647/pan_to_sscfgs_on_budget_2019_final2.pdf

http://www.panvancouver.ca/uploads/6/7/1/4/67145647/20171006_scc_for_budget_2018_19_f.pdf

http://www.panvancouver.ca/uploads/6/7/1/4/67145647/pan_presentation_to_the_ssc_sept_19_2016_end_notes.pdf



Appendix A

**Response to Questions on Notice
from the
Parent Advocacy Network for Public Education
for the
Select Standing Committee on Finance and Government Services
Hearing of September 19, 2016**

From the Hansard Script

G. Heyman: In that case, I'll make the question two parts.

1. One of them is....You talked about parents fundraising. I've certainly heard a lot of that when I attend Parent Advisory Committees in my constituency. So I'm wondering if you could provide a list of the kinds of things over the last decade that parents have been asked to fundraise for which were previously considered, or which you consider to be, part of the basic education system that should be provided.

While the Parent Advocacy Network has asked this question in the past of parents and PACs throughout our network, we used this opportunity to pose these questions to them again to bring forward more current responses. We received 110 responses to both questions asked by G Heyman, representing the experiences of 33 elementary and 5 high schools in Vancouver, SD 39, as well as responses from school districts across the province; these are SD 68, SD 85, SD 38, SD 61, SD 83, SD 67, SD 23, SD 57, SD43, and SD36. Given the broad spectrum of schools and districts represented, the responses compiled are further compelling evidence for the extent to which parents and PAC's are subsidizing public education. Items marked with an ~ were high frequency items. Items marked with a * were consistent across all responses.

PAC fundraising has been used to purchase the following resources that should be provided as part of the basic public education system:

- Technology for classrooms and whole school use * (ipads, laptops, printers, scanners, computers, charging cart, smart boards, specialized software, audio-visual equipment including projectors, LCD projector, sound system for assemblies, microphones, speakers, headphones, cords)
- General classrooms supplies *(i.e. paper, markers, crayons, books, notebooks, tissues, agendas, glue, dry erase markers, decorations, charts, craft supplies, organizational supplies such as baskets and containers)
- Supplies needed by Resource staff~
- Cleaning and custodial supplies
- Art Materials (i.e. paint, paper, brushes, clay)*
- Library books~
- French atlases and general atlases~
- Classroom books~ (including novel sets)
- graded/leveled readers for literacy support~
- primary home reading books~
- learning aids
- texts books in higher grades (as much as \$60 per book)
- Musical instruments and music stands~
- Science supplies and kits



- Math programs, textbooks and workbooks*
- Math manipulatives
- Robotics kits
- Physical education equipment and supplies* (i.e. mats, sports jerseys/pinneys, balls, hula hoops, volley ball nets, cones etc. for recess and PE)
- Sensory aids and equipment for special education resource including Time Timers, wiggle chairs etc.~
- Technology for special needs support
- Breakfast programs for children who can't afford it
- School Emergency Kits

PAC fundraising has been used to purchase the following furnishing and infrastructure items that should be provided as part of a basic public school education:

- Curtains~
- Carpets
- Air conditioner
- Student telephone
- Library and general furniture~
- Music space
- Drying rack
- Kiln
- Chairs for students and teachers~
- Bookshelves
- Risers for gym~
- Gym scoreboard for competitions (high school)
- Cafeteria tables~
- Water fountain station~
- Bike racks
- Playground structures and equipment, new and replacement*
- New turf for outdoor track
- Outdoor benches~ (some for special needs students for waiting for buses)
- Landscaping and gardens/grounds~ (including trees and gardening equipment)
- Maintenance costs for playground and landscaping including mulching and resurfacing~
- Painting lines on playground for basketball courts and hopscotch
- Necessities for portable classrooms (including shoe racks, boot trays, door mats and umbrellas)
- transportation - school buses- rural areas~
- Custodial support time for any afterschool activity~

PAC fundraising has paid for these core (not enriched) educational areas of instruction:

- Physical education~ (including swimming, gymnastics, ice skating)
- Music Instruction*
- Choral Instruction
- Art Instruction*
- Sexual education*
- Science Instruction
- Drama Instruction
- Dance Instruction



- Safeteen (avoiding violence and bullying) and internet safety courses

PAC volunteer time is also used to compensate for loss of teachers in the following areas:

- library staffing
- classroom support workers
- art, music, dance, drama, phys ed. instruction

PAC fundraising and parent funding has been used to provide the following enrichments that should be provided within the basic educational system:

- all curricular enhancements*
- all field trips*
- School performances* (music, drama, aboriginal to fulfill cultural curriculum)
- School buses for field trips~ to local galleries, museums etc.
- Graduation ceremonies
- Food and Nutrition Program (i.e. Project Chef)
- Clubs (chess etc.)~
- Sports teams

Parents are privately outsourcing the following educational services and supports due to the loss of these basic educational programs and supports within the public system:

- Tutoring - in basic literacy, reading and math (children who need support but are not of highest need do not qualify for resource time)*
- Tutoring to support high school students taking online courses because of reduced course offerings in school
- Art classes~
- Individual Music lessons (around \$1200 per year) - orchestra/band experiences are only possible within schools*
- Drama, Dance or Choir lessons~
- Testing for special needs and/or learning disabilities including Psych Ed Assessment, OT assessment, Speech/Language assessment (Average wait time for school based assessment 2-3 years)~
- Speech Language pathologist support
- Occupational Therapy
- Physiotherapy
- Speech Therapy (\$70 for 30 minute session)
- Counseling support
- Math support, e.g. Kumon \$120 per month per child~
- Sports lessons/teams (\$500 per term per child)~

It should be noted, that the ability of parent communities to fundraise for their schools is not evenly distributed. In a recent report by the *Globe and Mail* in 2013/2014, yearly parent fundraising (and charitable donations) within Vancouver Schools ranged from \$501 per student to \$0. (See the Fundraising Totals at Every Vancouver School, [The Globe and Mail](http://www.theglobeandmail.com), Feb. 20, 2015 www.theglobeandmail.com › News › British Columbia) The cumulative effect is an increasing inequity of access to basic educational resources, programs and amenities within schools across the province based on socio-economic status.

"Our PAC had to raise \$150,000 last year in order to replace the playground equipment at our elementary school. It seems to me that a playground is a pretty fundamental part of a school's



infrastructure and isn't really an optional extra or luxury item."
Christian Malcolm, Trafalgar Elementary, SD 39

"This (technology) is not necessarily equipment that would have been covered by the school in the past decade but they are items that are now deemed necessary by BC through the new curriculum (e.g. the technology piece) but which are not adequately being funded. This is creating a greater divide between the haves and have-nots, not just within Public/Private education but within the Public system itself where poorer schools simply do not get reading recovery material or access to technology."
Katherine Morrison, Maple Grove Elementary, SD 39.

"I paid for my daughter to have a music education for 3 years. I was angry that it was not a part of the basic education but willing to pay for it in order not to lose that fundamental learning for my child. That paid opportunity was then taken away from us this year leaving my daughter with an unfinished experience and my son with no music learning whatsoever at the Elementary level. This is shocking to me. Music is an essential part of the human experience and a basic understanding of music as a language has been proven to be an exceptional way of aiding learning in many other subjects including math and language arts. I was angry, now I am furious and frustrated. As a single parent with active kids I am unable to budget for the high cost of individual music lessons. The loss of music programming at the elementary level has hit our family hard."
Lord Tennyson, SD 39

"I'm not sure what category this fits in but children from grade 7 taught PE in my son's class last year- there was no PE teacher for the entire year for his class."
Nootka Elementary, SD 39

"I'm gravely concerned at the offering of online courses for secondary students. The absence of the classroom forces parents to fill the teaching/ mentoring gap by paying for tutors to ensure comprehension and success in the online courses."

2. The other one is.... Under the capacity utilization, you mentioned early childhood education. I know there are some other uses to which school space is put which are not factored by the Ministry of Education. Putting that on the record as well and their use in the community would be very helpful. We collated the information provided by the parents from the 38 Vancouver schools who responded to our survey and from public information on the VSB to answer this second question. Our key findings were that in older schools with 'surplus capacity', rooms dedicated to core educational functions (such as music) or key support services (such as sensory rooms) were counted as empty space by the ministry. We find it reprehensible that the government would seek to eliminate these spaces throughout the district, particularly in light of the personalized learning focus of the new curriculum and the growing complexity of learning needs. In addition, many of the schools with lower capacity in Vancouver, serve populations with more complex educational needs due to socio-economic factors. In this respect, additional resource/community space is crucial for meeting the educational needs of these populations. Vancouver has been exemplary in maximizing surplus space for the benefit of communities in keeping with the government's own initiative to make schools Neighbourhoods hubs of Learning. Early childhood education and care, before and after school care, English language education, adult education and immigrant programs remain key services that are crucial to the wellbeing of communities in Vancouver that are threatened because of LACK of available and affordable space. These programs, that are compatible with family needs, should be expanded into more schools with space rather than eliminated.



Core-curricular educational programs or support services are offered in the following non-enrolling classrooms in Vancouver schools that are deemed "empty" by the Ministry of Education. Schools that were at or over capacity were not able to offer these programs or services due to lack of space.

- Music room
- Art room
- Computer room
- Drama room
- Aboriginal Education room
- Parent room - crucial for inner city schools
- Special needs spaces such as Sensory rooms/decompression room/ extra resource space/ reading recovery room/safespace for schools with higher needs

In high school the following specialty spaces (that require fewer students) are counted as proportionally empty if they have an enrollment lower than 25 and if they are not used 100% of the time regardless of their unique space needs or prep requirements:

- Shop
- Art room
- Home Economics
- Science labs

In Elementary schools the following special needs programs (with reduced enrolment count towards surplus space) . There are currently 25 such programs operating within Vancouver schools. Examples include:

- Social Emotional Academic Development program (cap of 10)
- Extended Learning Assistance Classes (cap of 15)
- TEIR reading program (cap of 8)
- Multi Aged Cluster Classes for gifted students (cap of 20)
- Life Skills (cap of 15 in 10 high schools and one elementary school using multiple rooms)

The Following District services that need space - are using 'empty' space within schools:

- DRPC (District Reception and Placement Centre)
- Learning Services
- District Psych-Educational Centre
- Vancouver Learning Network - Distance Education
- Home Learners Program

Community Groups/Programs that use/rent space within schools to provide services to families:

- ELL classes
- Continuing/Adult Basic Education
- Before/after school care (63 elementary schools)
- Boys and Girls clubs (rented)
- Daycare
- Preschools (29 private preschools in Vancouver elementary schools- not Strong start)
- Counseling/Social support services



- At-risk youth (AR Lord)
- Cadets
- PIRS (Pacific Immigrant Resources Society)
- EYRP (Early Years Refugee Program)
- IPALS Immigrant Parents as Literacy Support Program
- Green Thumb Theatre
- Sarah McLaughlin Music Program and also St. James Academy Music Program

"As well, as I'm sure many parents will comment, the school offers extremely limited after school care options that are full and cannot accommodate the vast majority of incoming kindergarten students. Every parent I have spoken to has either shifted work hours or cobbled together expensive nanny sharing services or family pickups to get their children after school. Our daughter will be in a patchwork of after school care arrangements as we scramble to find someone to care for her well after school. This lack of aftercare seems a total oversight that should be covered by school budgets as virtually no parent in the modern world works from 9-3 as the school hours suggest, and no family can afford to be a single income family in today's economic environment, especially those of us in the financially squeezed millennial generation (no jobs or jobs being paid less money, yay)"
Lord Tennyson Elementary, SD 39

Appendix B

Arts Education is essential for building a healthy, pluralistic and democratic society:

Arts Education develops aesthetic and imaginative capacities for human fulfillment

- The right to engage in cultural production and to enjoy the arts is a fundamental human right. *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*, Article 27, 1949. <http://www.un.org/en/universal-declaration-human-rights/>
- The arts are an intrinsic part of our human social and emotional experience. Dewey, John. *Art as Experience*. Perigree Books, (1934) 1980; Dessanyake, Ellen. *Homo Aestheticus: Where Art Comes from and Why*. University of Washington Press, 1992.
- The Capability Approach identifies “imagination, thought and senses” as well as “play” as one of the 10 capabilities that are the conditions for and indicators for human flourishing in terms of justice and freedom in societies. Kleist, Chad. “Global Ethics: Capabilities Approach.” *Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. <http://www.iep.utm.edu/ge-capab/>

Arts education supports democratic citizenship and promotes intercultural understanding

- Cultivating imagination opens up the empathic, aesthetic, and generative capacity for social transformation. Greene, Maxine. *Releasing the Imagination: Essays on Education, the Arts and Social Change*. Jossey-Bass, 2000.
- Arts education fosters “Imaginative Understanding”, one of the 3 capabilities alongside critical thinking and world citizenship identified by Nussbaum as central to the “cultivation of humanity in today’s interlocking world.” Maguire, Cindy. “The Capabilities Approach and Citizenship Education: What the Arts Have to Offer.” *Prospero: A Journal of New Thinking in the Philosophy of Education* Vol 14, 2008.
- UNESCO has highlighted the important role of arts education in promoting intercultural understanding in a rapidly changing world. *Seoul Agenda: Goals for the Development of Art Education from the Second World Conference on Art Education*, UNESCO, 2010)
- Freedom and opportunity to practice art and culture is a right of Indigenous People. *United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People*, Article 11. http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/documents/DRIPS_en.pdf
- Art and cultural practices are integral to indigenous ways of knowing; they constitute a foundational literacy through which history, community, spirituality and cultural regeneration is expressed. Access to culturally appropriate curriculum is an educational mandate of the Canadian Truth and Reconciliation Commission. *Truth and Reconciliation Commission Calls to Action*, Item 10.3, 2016. http://www.trc.ca/websites/trcinstitution/File/2015/Findings/Calls_to_Action_English2.pdf
- Neuroscientists link arts engagement and the attention to other perspectives as key to developing the capacity for empathy in the brain. Bazalgette, Peter. *The Empathy Instinct: How to Create a More*

Civil Society. John Murray Publishers, 2017; Bazalgette, *Arts, Culture and Empathy lecture*, January 2017; James Catteral, “A Neuroscience of Art and Human Empathy”, (draft) 2011.
www.croc-lab.org/uploads/7/9/9/8/7998314/neuroscience-art-empathy.docx

Arts education promotes mental health and well-being

- Mental health issues in young people are on the rise and are a growing concern amongst educators and policy makers. Chai, Carmen. “[Why more Canadians than ever are at risk of mental health issues.](#)”, *Global News*, May 2017)
<https://globalnews.ca/news/3417600/why-more-canadian-millennials-than-ever-are-at-high-risk-of-mental-health-issues/>
- Engagement in the arts are shown to promote mental well-being. Rogers, Natalie. *The Creative Connection: Expressive Arts as Healing*. Palo Alto, Calif: Science & Behaviour Books, 2000; “Everything we know about how and whether the arts Improve our lives”, *Create Equity*, 2011
<http://createequity.com/2016/12/everything-we-know-about-whether-and-how-the-arts-improve-lives/>; “Part of your World: Art and Wellbeing”, *Create Equity*, 2015
<http://createequity.com/2015/08/part-of-your-world-on-the-arts-and-wellbeing/>
- Quality arts education increases the expressive capacities and emotional regulation of children who have experienced trauma. *Heart: Healing and education through the arts*. Save the Children.org
<http://www.savethechildren.org/atf/cf/%7B9def2ebe-10ae-432c-9bd0-df91d2eba74a%7D/HEART.PDF>
- Evidence-based research demonstrates a relationship between the arts, increased self-confidence, self-worth and resilience or grit. Uptis., *Rena Arts Education for the Development of the Whole Child*. Kingston: Queens University, 2011; Hetland, Winner, Veenema and Sheridan, *Studio Thinking 2: The Real Benefits of Visual Arts Education*. Harvard University Press, 2013; Varghese, Sheena. "Guidelines for Teaching Art to Students from Urban High-Poverty Backgrounds." *Thesis*, Georgia State University, 2015.
https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/art_design_theses/177/
- High arts engagement has a strong correlation with improved life outcomes for disadvantaged youth in academic achievement, employment opportunity and civic engagement. *The Arts and Achievement in At-Risk Youth: Findings from Four Longitudinal Studies*, National Endowment for the Arts, 2012.
<https://www.arts.gov/sites/default/files/Arts-At-Risk-Youth.pdf>

Arts education respects multiple intelligences and allows for inclusive learning

- Education in the arts honours and supports the development of multiple intelligences. Gardner, Howard. “The Happy Meeting of Multiple Intelligences and the Arts.” *Harvard Education Letter* Vol. 5.6, 1999.
http://hepg.org/hel-home/issues/15_6/helarticle/the-happy-meeting-of-multiple-intelligences-and-th
- Arts education reaches students that are hard to reach. Kreger Silverman, Linda. “At-risk Youth and the Creative Process,” *Gifted Development Centre* <http://www.gifteddevelopment.com/visual-spatial/risk-youth-and-creative-process>; Fiske Edward B., Ed. *Champions of Change: The Impact of*



the Arts on Learning, Arts Education Partnership, 1999.

<http://artsedge.kennedy-center.org/champions/pdfs/champsreport.pdf>

- The arts are shown to increase academic engagement and achievement for children with learning disabilities and for ELL students. Menzer, Melisa. *The Arts in Early Childhood: Social and Emotional Benefits of arts*, [National Endowment for the Arts](#), 2015.
<https://www.arts.gov/sites/default/files/arts-in-early-childhood-dec2015-rev.pdf>
- Education in the arts enhances the underlying brain processes that support learning; sensory, attentional, cognitive emotional, motor. Jensen, Eric. *Arts with the Brain in Mind*, Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, 2001.
- Learning through the arts improves academic achievement for all children. Fowler. "Strong Arts Strong schools: The promising potential and short-sighted disregard of the arts in American schooling", *Educational Leadership: Strategies for Success* 52.3. Oxford University Press, 1996; Uptis, 2002.

Arts Education is essential for building a prosperous and sustainable economy:

Creativity is a key skill for the 21st century economy

- Creativity is widely recognized by business and educational leaders as the primary skillset needed for the 21st century economy. *Creativity Unleashed: Taking Creativity out of the Laboratory and into the Labour Force*, 2011-2012 Action Canada Task Force Report, 2012. <http://www.actioncanada.ca/wp-content/uploads/2014/04/AC-TF3-Creativity-Report-EN-web.pdf>; *Ready to Innovate*, Conference Board, 2008. <https://www.americansforthearts.org/sites/default/files/ReadytoInnovateFull.pdf>; [Policy Research Group](#), *The Creative economy: Concepts and Literature Review Highlights*, May 2013. https://cch.novascotia.ca/sites/default/files/inline/documents/creative-economy-synthesis_201305.pdf
- The Torrance Test of Creative Thinking has shown a steady decline in creativity across all metrics since 1990 Kim, Kyung Hee. "The Creativity Crisis: The Decrease in Creative Thinking Scores on the Torrance Test of Creative Thinking." *Creativity Research Journal* Nov. 2011. https://www.nesacenter.org/uploaded/conferences/SEC/2013/handouts/Kim_Creativity-Crisis_CRJ2011.pdf
- Canada's global competitiveness is compromised by declining innovation capacity according to recent World Economic Forum results. "Poor Innovation Ranking Dims the Light on Canada's Competitiveness and Prosperity," *Conference Board of Canada*, 2012. http://www.conferenceboard.ca/press/newsrelease/12-09-27/Poor_Innovation_Ranking_Dims_the_Lights_on_Canada_s_Competitiveness_and_Prosperty.aspx?AspxAutoDetectCookieSupport=1
- Canada ranks 24 out of 28 countries and well behind the OECD average for compulsory arts as a percentage of instructional time for 9-11 year-olds. Winner and Vincent-Pancrin, *Art for Arts Sake? The Impact of Arts Education*, OECD, 2013. <http://www.oecd.org/education/cei/arts.htm>

©2020 Parent Advocacy Network for Public Education. All rights reserved. Parent Advocacy Network is non partisan; we do not endorse, and are not affiliated with any particular party or individual

- PISA is redesigning its international test to reflect the need for assessing creativity, Romer, Christy. “Creativity in Schools to be Compared across the World.” *Arts Professional* Jan. 2018.
<https://www.artsprofessional.co.uk/news/creativity-schools-be-compared-across-world>

Arts education is key for developing the skillset for creativity and innovation

- Fine Arts and Communications graduates are most likely to possess the divergent thinking skills needed for creativity and innovation. Conference Board, 2008; Policy Research Group, 2013.
- Preliminary results from STEM education initiatives in North America have not demonstrated improvement in creativity or divergent thinking. Integrating the arts stimulates innovation and creativity. Sousa, David and Tom Pilecki. *From STEM to STEAM: Using Brain-Compatible Strategies to Integrate the Arts*. Corwin 2013.
- Companies that integrate arts with sciences outperform companies that do not, in both innovation and growth. Cultural Learning Alliance. *STEAM: Why STEM can take us only so far*. Briefing Paper, 2013.
<https://culturallearningalliance.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/CD405-CLA-STEAM-Briefing-Teachers-Notes-08.pdf>
- Participation in the arts develops creative habits of mind. Hetland, Winner, Veenema and Sheridan, *Studio Thinking 2: The Real Benefits of Visual Arts Education*, Harvard U P, 2013; Winner and Vincent Pancrin, *Art for arts sake? The Impact of Arts Education*, OECD, 2013; *Neuroeducation: Learning, Arts and the Brain: Findings and Challenges for Educators and Researchers from the 2009 John Hopkins University Summit*, Dana Foundation, 2009.
https://www.giarts.org/sites/default/files/Neuroeducation_Learning-Arts-and-the-Brain.pdf
- The arts act as a catalyst for innovative thinking across all economic sectors.
- Neuroscientists are linking increased emphasis on technology to the decrease in right brain capacities that include creativity, empathy and big picture thinking. McGilchrist, Iain. *The Master and his Emissary: The Divided Brain and the Making of the Western World*. Yale University Press, 2009.
- *The Select Standing Committee Report on the Budget 2018 Consultations* recommends that government make an investment in K-12 education in the arts to support BC’s creative economy.
https://www.leg.bc.ca/content/CommitteeDocuments/41st-parliament/2nd-session/FGS/Budget2018Consultation/FGS_2017-11-15_Budget2018Consultation_Report.pdf

Arts education is relevant for critical engagement in today’s public communication sphere

- Multimedia technologies have transformed the sphere of public communications and engagement in today’s world. Scott McMaster, *Visual Literacy and Art Education: A Review of the Literature*, 2015
https://www.researchgate.net/publication/280319601_Visual_Literacy_and_Art_Education_Review_of_the_Literature
- As early as 1987, an estimated 85% of the information absorbed on a daily basis is visual rather than textual. McMaster, 2015.



- Students must develop visual literacy and a critical understanding of how imagery shapes and informs our values and beliefs. Bamford, Ann. *The Visual Literacy White Paper*. Adobe Systems Inc., 2003 <https://www.aperture.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/05/visual-literacy-wp.pdf>; Oring, Stuart. “A Call for Visual Literacy,” *The Free Library*. Davis Publications, Inc. 2000 <https://www.thefreelibrary.com/A+CALL+FOR+VISUAL+LITERACY.-a061524607>

The arts and culture sector is an important and growing part of BC’s economy

- The United Nations has identified the creative economy as one of the world's fastest growing sectors for income generation, job creation and export earnings. Government of British Columbia, *Factsheet: Arts, Culture and the Creative Economy* 2018. <https://news.gov.bc.ca/factsheets/arts-culture-and-the-creative-economy>
- Arts and culture are an important indicator of economic competitiveness and growth in leading economies. *Otis Report on the Creative Economy*. Los Angeles Economic Development Corporation, 2017. <https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/sports-culture/arts-culture/facts-and-stats>
- Investment in the arts yields positive returns of up to ten times when accounting for direct, indirect and induced benefits. *A Strategic and economic business case for investment in the arts*, Business for the Arts, 2009. <http://www.businessforthearts.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/02/BftA-business-case-for-funding-the-arts.pdf>
- B.C.’s total culture GDP in 2014 was 3% of BC’s GDP or about \$6.7 billion, a \$1 billion increase since 2010. Government of British Columbia, *Arts and Culture Facts and Stats*, 2018. <https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/sports-culture/arts-culture/facts-and-stats>
- More British Columbians participate in art and culture related activities than citizens of other province Hill, Kelly. *Findings of background research in the state of British Columbia Arts and Culture*, Feb 2016. https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5266d49be4b0bc5cd29ee8e0/t/56c49cf2e321405712151c85/1455725812351/Alliance1_background.pdf